

RESOLUTION NO. 17-035

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PASO ROBLES
AUTHORIZING THE REMOVAL OF ONE 54" VALLEY OAK TREE
AT 1600 COUNTRY CLUB DRIVE
(OTR 17-004 / PASO ROBLES GOLF CLUB) APN: 009-461-049

WHEREAS, Mike Rawitzer of Paso Robles Golf Course has filed a request for the removal of one 54" Valley oak tree within fairway No. 5 of the Paso Robles Golf Course, located at 1600 Country Club Drive; and

WHEREAS, an Arborist Report prepared by Carolyn B. Leach, Certified Arborist has been provided which concludes that the tree has significant disease, including visible cavities, root crown decay and is in imminent danger of failing; and

WHEREAS, the Community Development Director could not make the determination that the tree is "clearly dead or diseased beyond correction," and therefore, Section 10.01.050.C of the Oak Tree Ordinance would consider the tree "healthy" and require that the City Council make the determination of whether the tree should be removed or not, after consideration of the factors listed in Section 10.01.050.D; and

NOW, THEREFORE, THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF EL PASO DE ROBLES DOES HEREBY RESOLVE AS FOLLOWS:

Section 1. All of the above recitals are true and correct and incorporated herein by reference.

Section 2. Findings: Pursuant to Paso Robles Municipal Code section 10.01.050.D., and based on the entire record including all written and oral evidence presented, the City Council finds as follows:

1. Having considered the factors outlined in Section 10.01.050.D.1. of the Paso Robles Municipal Code, and the information provided by the Arborist in Exhibit A, the City Council finds that allowing the removal of the tree would seem to be consistent with finding D.1, based on the trees being in poor condition, and allowing for the removal of the tree would prevent the possibility of the tree falling into the fairway where golfers and golf course employees are present throughout the day. Mitigation trees will be required.

Section 3: Approval. The City Council of the City of El Paso de Robles does hereby:

1. Authorize the removal of one 54" Valley Oak tree located within Fairway No. 5 of the Paso Robles Golf Club, based on the trees being in poor health and in imminent risk of sudden failure, as indicated in the Arborist Report, attached as Exhibit A;
2. Require ten (10) 1.5-inch diameter Valley oak replacement trees (or fewer replacement trees adding up to 13.5-inches) to be plated at the direction of the Arborist.

PASSED AND APPROVED by the City Council of the City of El Paso de Robles this 21st day of March 2017 by the following vote:

AYES: Strong, Hamon, Gregory, Reed, Martin
NOES:
ABSTAIN:
ABSENT:



Steven W. Martin, Mayor

ATTEST:



Kristen L. Buxkemper, Deputy City Clerk

Exhibit A: Arborist Report

Carolyn B. Leach Consulting L.L.C.
444 Blume Street
Nipomo, CA 93444
(805)929-9020
W.C.I.S.A. Certified Arborist #727

March 9 2107

Mr. Darren Nash
City of Paso Robles Community Development Department
1000 Spring Street
Paso Robles, CA 93446

Re: Paso Robles Golf Club

Dear Mr. Nash:

I have recently been asked to inspect 13 oak trees at the Paso Robles Golf Club. My inspection took place on March 7, 2017. I looked at all 13 trees and evaluated their current conditions.

I found several trees with varying problems, such as interior decay and heavy branch weight. I will be preparing a report that makes recommendations to the golf course for future care, such as pruning or, when appropriate, tree removal.



Of the 13 trees, I found one tree in particular that alarmed me with its severe degree of structural deterioration. This tree is located on hole #5, and is the subject of my 3/7/17 letter to Mr. Mike Rawitser, a copy of which I am attaching to this letter. It is also pictured in the photo here.

The tree is a Valley oak with a 54" trunk diameter. It is located in the middle of the fairway just where the hole turns to the right. This location is where most golfers first shot lands from the #5 tee, so is frequently occupied by golfers all day long. Additionally, employees are frequently passing below the tree.

Received
03/9/17
City of Paso Robles
Community Development



I found at least four clusters of dried mushrooms that are most likely Oak root rot disease, *Armillaria mellea*. The photo above of the base of the tree above with the dried mushrooms indicated by the arrows.



Here is a photo of me holding one of the mushroom clusters.

The clusters were located on about 75% of the trunk circumference. When I chipped into the bark at the trunk base, I found the entire bark and inner sapwood to be rotted by the disease.

From the little amount of twigs developed in the canopy last year, the tree has been suffering from this disease for some time now.

This tree will die from this amount of infection.

In the meanwhile, the tree is in extremely high likelihood of falling over. The disease is rotting away all of the structural root support. It is highly hazardous.

My recommendation to the property owners is to remove the tree as soon as possible.

I am attaching to this letter a form from the International Society of Arboriculture that further describes this tree.

Please let me know if you have any additional questions.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Carolyn Leach". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Carolyn Leach
Consulting Arborist

Limiting Conditions:

Information in this report covers only the trees examined and reflects the conditions of the trees at the time of inspection. There is no warranty, either express or implied, that the subject trees will not develop problems or deficiencies in the future. Sources of information used in this report are accepted as standard resources; however, the author cannot guarantee the accuracy of information provided by others. Possession of this report or a copy thereof does not imply the right of publication or use for any purpose by any other than the person to whom it is addressed, without the prior written consent of the consultant. Loss or alteration of this report invalidates the entire report. The inspection is limited to visual examination of tree location, as viewed from the ground, without dissection, excavation, probing, or coring. No review of tree structural conditions or hazard potential has been provided.

No part of this report is to be viewed as engineering, surveying, or any other trade other than arboriculture.

Carolyn B. Leach Consulting L.L.C.
444 Blume Street
Nipomo, CA 93444
(805)929-9020
W.C.I.S.A. Certified Arborist #727

March 7, 2017

Mr. Mike Rawitser
Paso Robles Golf Club
1600 Country Club Drive
Paso Robles, CA 93446

RE: Tree Inspection

Dear Mr. Rawitser:

Today I completed my inspection of 13 large oak trees at your golf course. My work includes checking the trees for visible problems, such as cavities, root crown stability, and trunk or branch issues. I will use this information to formulate my recommendations for future care. I will be writing a report later this week that presents my findings and opinions.



During my inspection, I found a tree in such poor condition that I immediately gave you my verbal opinion that it is in **imminent risk of sudden failure**. This tree, shown in this photo, is in the middle of the #5 fairway. It is a *Quercus lobate* with a 54" trunk diameter. The entire circumference of the root crown area, where the trunk meets the ground, is decayed.

I dug down below soil level all around the tree base and found it entirely rotted. Additionally, I saw the remains of 4 clusters of mushrooms which appeared to be *Armillaria mellea*, also known as oak root fungus. This decaying disease infects the woody roots as well as the root crown area, leaving behind pulpy textured wood with no holding capacity.

I am shocked that the tree is still standing with that vast amount of decay.

Please remove this tree as soon as possible.

Until the tree is removed, I suggest roping off the area with caution tape, to alert the golfers and your employees of the risk.

Sincerely,

Carolyn Leach
Consulting Arborist



Basic Tree Risk Assessment Form

Client: PASO ROBLES GOLF CLUB Date: 3/9/17 Time: 10:45 am
 Address/Tree location: 1600 COUNTRY CLUB DRIVE, HOLE # 5 Tree no.: 5 Sheet 1 of 2
 Tree species: QUERCUS LOBATA dbh: 54" Height: 50'-60' Crown spread dia.: 45'
 Assessor(s): CAROLYN LEACH Time frame: _____ Tools used: HAND SPADE
 DATE OF INSPECTION: 3/7/2017 Target Assessment

Target number	Target description	Target zone			Occupancy rate 1-rare 2-occasional 3-frequent 4-constant	Practical to move target?	Restriction practical?
		Target within drip line	Target within 1 x Ht.	Target within 1.5 x Ht.			
1	GOLF COURSE FAIRWAY / LANDING AREA	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		3	NO	NO
2							
3							
4							

Site Factors

History of failures: 10", 8" dia. Topography: Flat Slope % Aspect: _____
 Site changes: None Grade change Site clearing Changed soil hydrology Root cuts Describe: _____
 Soil conditions: Limited volume Saturated Shallow Compacted Pavement over roots % Describe: NORMAL TURF
 Prevailing wind direction: _____ Common weather: Strong winds Ice Snow Heavy rain Describe: _____

Tree Health and Species Profile

Vigor: Low Normal High Foliage: None (seasonal) None (dead) Normal _____ % Chlorotic _____ % Necrotic _____ %
 Pests: ARMILLARIA ROOT ROT Abiotic: _____
 Species failure profile: Branches Trunk Roots Describe: _____

Load Factors

Wind exposure: Protected Partial Full Wind funneling Relative crown size: Small Medium Large
 Crown density: Sparse Normal Dense Interior branches: Few Normal Dense Vines/Mistletoe/Moss NO
 Recent or planned change in load factors: NO

Tree Defects and Conditions Affecting the Likelihood of Failure

— Crown and Branches —

Unbalanced crown LCR < 10% Cracks Lightning damage
 Dead twigs/branches 90% overall Max. dia. 8-10" Codominant Included bark
 Broken/Hangers Number _____ Max. dia. _____ Weak attachments Cavity/Nest hole _____ % circ.
 Over-extended branches Previous branch failures TO 10" dia Similar branches present
Pruning history
 Crown cleaned Thinned Raised Dead/Missing bark Cankers/Galls/Burls Sapwood damage/decay
 Reduced Topped Lion-tailed Conks Heartwood decay
 Flush cuts Other _____ Response growth: _____
 Main concern(s): ROOT FAILURE - ENTIRE ROOT CROWN CIRCUMFERENCE AFFECTED
 Load on defect: N/A Minor Moderate Significant ENTIRE TREE
 Likelihood of failure: Improbable Possible Probable Imminent

— Trunk —

Dead/Missing bark Abnormal bark texture/color
 Codominant stems Included bark Cracks
 Sapwood damage/decay Cankers/Galls/Burls Sap ooze
 Lightning damage Heartwood decay Conks/Mushrooms
 Cavity/Nest hole _____ % circ. Depth _____ Poor taper
 Lean _____ Corrected? _____
 Response growth: _____
 Main concern(s): _____
 Load on defect: N/A Minor Moderate Significant
 Likelihood of failure: Improbable Possible Probable Imminent

— Roots and Root Collar —

Collar buried/Not visible Depth _____ Stem girdling
 Dead Decay Conks/Mushrooms
 Ooze Cavity _____ % circ.
 Cracks Cut/Damaged roots Distance from trunk _____
 Root plate lifting Soil weakness
 Response growth: _____
 Main concern(s): ROOT FAILURE, TREE TOPPLING OVER
 Load on defect: N/A Minor Moderate Significant
 Likelihood of failure: Improbable Possible Probable Imminent

