

TO: City Council  
FROM: James L. App, City Manager  
SUBJECT: Executive Search – Public Works Director  
DATE: August 5, 2014

---

Needs: For the City Council to engage outside assistance to conduct a State-wide search for Director of Public Works.

Facts:

1. Doug Monn, Director of Public Works, plans to retire January 2015.
2. A State-wide search is indicated to attract experienced professionals well-versed in the disciplines/services offered by the Department.
3. There are a number of Executive Search firms that specialize in assisting local governments in the recruitment and selection of public executives.
4. The City received two proposals from qualified Executive Search firms.

Analysis &  
Conclusion:

Generally, professionals with the requisite sophistication of utilities operations, capital improvement projects, strategic planning, and executive management skills are currently employed with other public agencies. Soliciting their interest is challenging and highly competitive.

Executive Search firms have established access to, and an accepted means for soliciting public executives. Additionally, these firms can assist in certain labor intensive and time consuming elements of the search and selection process.

Proposals were sought and two were received (see attached proposal summary). Both firms are well known and accomplished search firms. Proposed fees (including expenses) range from an estimated \$19,400 to \$24,400.

Avery & Associates appears to have the most well suited proposal. The principal, Bill Avery, is well acquainted with Paso Robles' unique character and challenges as a result of a long professional affiliation. He assisted the City in the successful placement of Community Development Director Ron Whisenand and Police Chief Robert Burton. He is also currently conducting the Executive Search for the City's Community Development Director position.

It is important to note that the outcome of any search process cannot be guaranteed. Success is a function of market dynamics including competition, availability,

marketability, timing, etc. However, the City would be assured of market penetration, as well as professional recruitment and selection assistance.

Policy

Reference: Avery & Associates proposal dated July 9, 2014.

Fiscal Impact: Avery & Associates proposed cost for search services if \$13,900, plus not to exceed expense costs of \$5,500. The total estimated cost of \$19,400 would be drawn from General Fund Reserves (current balance estimated of approximately \$7,400,000).

Options:

1. Authorize the City Manager to Execute a Contract with Avery & Associates for Executive Search Services, and approved the Budget Adjustment Request to appropriate funds from General Fund Reserves in the amount of \$19,400.
2. Amend, modify, or reject the foregoing option.

Attachments:

1. Summary of Proposals received
2. Avery & Associates Proposal – dated July 9, 2014
3. Budget Adjustment Request

Summary of Executive Search Proposals

Public Works Director

Williams Avery & Associates

Search Cost: \$13,900

Expenses: \$5,500 (not to exceed)

Guarantee: Replace at no charge during first year (resignation/termination)

Notes: Worked with City in multiple Director recruitments - (Police Chief, Administrative Services & Community Development). Currently contracted for Paso Robles' Community Development Director search.

Bob Murray & Associates

Search Cost: \$17,500

Expenses: \$6,900 (not to exceed)

Guarantee: None noted

Notes: Worked with City in a past Public Works Director search.



July 9, 2014

Marlaine Sanders, HR Manager  
City of Paso Robles  
1000 Spring Street  
Paso Robles, CA 93446

Dear Ms. Sanders,

We are pleased to submit our proposal for the recruitment of a new Public Works Director for the City of Paso Robles. We value our ongoing working relationship with the City and would look forward to supporting your needs in this assignment.

We feel well suited to perform this search based on our extensive experience with public works and utilities related recruitments. These assignments include the current search for a Public Works Director for the City of Hercules and recently completed assignments including Resource Recovery Services Director for the Delta Diablo Sanitation District (04/2014) and Public Works Directors for Marin County (02/2014) and Monterey County (08/2012), General Manager for the West Valley Sanitation District (05/2012), Executive Director of the California Association of Sanitation Agencies (06/2012), Deputy Director for Wastewater Operations for the City of Stockton (12/2012), City Engineer and the Utilities Manager for the City of Beverly Hills (both completed 05/2013), General Manager for the Soquel Creek Water District (05/2013), and the Deputy General Manager for the Union Sanitary District (06/2013). These collective assignments have given us a large, current and active database of public works and engineering professionals in the field.

Following review of our proposal, it is our hope that our relationship with your City, our history of successful recruitments, our professionalism and positive results we have delivered for our clients will provide the basis for selection of our firm. Enclosed you will find the following information:

- Company Profile
- Firm Qualifications
- Recruitment Team
- Recruitment Plan
- Consulting Fee
- Guarantees & Ethics
- Recruitment Timeline

William Avery & Associates, Inc.  
Consultants to Management

3-1/2 N. Santa Cruz Ave., Suite A  
Los Gatos, CA 95030  
408.399.4424  
Fax: 408.399.4423  
www.averyassoc.net

Once again, thank you for the opportunity to submit our proposal to assist you with your recruitment. If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to call me at 408-399-4424.

Sincerely,

William H. Avery

WHA:jmc



# PROPOSAL FOR THE CITY OF PASO ROBLES FOR THE RECRUITMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

## William Avery & Associates, Inc. – Our Profile

William Avery & Associates, Inc. (Avery Associates) is a successful and service focused Management Consulting firm based in Los Gatos, California. Incorporated in 1982, the firm specializes in Executive Search, Labor Relations and Human Resources/Management Consulting.

The firm currently includes two Principals and several key consultants. Bill Avery, the founder of Avery Associates, heads the firm. He oversees the Labor Relations practice and also leads key searches. Paul Kimura is the Principal who oversees the Executive Search and Recruitment practice. Key staff members include Ann Slate, who supports the search practice and the firm's administrative staff includes Anne Matteini, the Finance/Contracts Administrator, and Jackie Collins and Jessica Towner. Temporary staff as needed augments the team.

Mr. Avery, having served in the past as a City Manager, provides the firm with direct experience and knowledge of city administration. Mr. Kimura's expertise in executive, technical and business recruitment, which he gained during his nineteen years of high technology experience, provides the basis for many of the recruitment strategies and tactics utilized by the firm. Collectively and combined, the firms Principals offer exceptional expertise in the area of public sector recruitment and consulting.

## Firm Qualifications – What Differentiates Avery Associates

Exceptional service delivery and a very high quality work product provide excellent results for our clients. This begins with the initial client meetings, which lead to detailed timelines for deliverables followed by weekly recruitment status updates following initiation of the search. Our candidate outreach efforts are professionally and confidentially conducted. The evaluation materials we provide clients are routinely characterized as accurate, comprehensive and of very high quality. We believe more so than any other public sector recruitment firm. This is largely based on our interview system utilizing behavioral interview techniques. This leads to a quality product with excellent end results for our clients.

The service element is based on two factors: The first is the collective service philosophy from all of our organizational team members. They are each dedicated to providing service and support to clients. The second factor is based on the high level of engagement and participation from the firm Principals in every search assignment. This hands-on involvement includes client interface, identifying and developing the ideal candidate profile and position specification, development of the search strategy, candidate outreach, interviewing and assessment, completion of reference interviews, candidate presentation, final interview facilitation and when desired, negotiation of employment terms with the successful candidate.



## Recruitment Team for the City of Paso Robles

Bill Avery will serve as the Project Lead in this assignment and will be supported by the administrative team of Avery Associates. Mr. Avery will be personally involved in the initial client meetings, development of the ideal candidate profile and search strategy, interviewing and assessment of candidates, the presentation of candidates, attendance at final interviews, and will be available throughout the search process to provide other related consulting services.

## Recruitment Plan and Services Provided

### I. Position Profile and Organizational Assessment

The initial assessment phase is a critical component of the search process. Mr. Avery will meet the City Manager and other city executives you deem appropriate to discuss the organizational needs and position requirements.

Our goal for this aspect of the recruitment process is to:

- Understand the City priorities for this position.
- Develop a clear understanding and consensus on the expertise, experience, education, performance attributes and operational style of the ideal candidate.
- Discuss the goals, objectives, deliverables, and challenges related to this position.
- Gain insight of the various organizational dynamics and departmental issues that exist within the organization.
- Identify the compelling aspects to this opportunity.

### II. Development of the Search Strategy and Candidate Outreach

Our search strategy will be developed in conjunction with the organizational assessment. For this assignment, we feel it is critical to develop a high level of visibility with a comprehensive outreach program supplemented by a focused targeted recruitment approach. We would incorporate the following elements into this search:

- Original research, which consists of identification and contact of current incumbents or other candidates who meet the profile, but are not actively seeking other employment.



- Development of a targeted candidate list based on our extensive database of key executive contacts, referrals and recommendations from key sources, and other current and former public works personnel who have extensive contacts and networks in this area.
- Public information sources that include various membership listings such as the League of California Cities, APWA, ASCE and the various municipal organizations within California and possibly nationwide.
- An extensive mailing campaign to current Public Works Directors throughout California.
- Print advertising Jobs Available and Western City (if timing allows) magazine.
- Internet job postings on national public works related bulletin boards, and our company website.

### III. Candidate Assessment

Our assessment process involves several “tiers” of evaluation. All candidates responding to this position will initially, be evaluated based on their resume and if appropriate, an extensive phone “screening” by a firm Consultant. Candidates who pass the initial “qualifying” criteria are then scheduled for a formal interview with the Principal in charge of the project. These extended personal interviews typically take one hour and a thorough discussion of their experience, accomplishments, management philosophy and interpersonal style takes place.

In interviewing candidates, we utilize a methodology based on “behavioral” interview techniques. Fundamentally, this approach explores a candidate’s past accomplishments and experiences. The philosophy here is that the best indicator of future performance is assessing past behavior. This methodology allows the firm to “project” how a candidate would approach and address challenges in the new position.

Those individuals who best fit the position requirements will have a Candidate Assessment Report developed by the Principal who conducted the interview. Additionally, two initial reference interviews are performed on these candidates. The reference interviews provide our clients with additional insights on the candidate’s “behavior” and style.

### IV. Candidate Presentation

Upon completion of formal interviews and initial reference interviews, a selection of candidates for presentation is made. We feel our extensive screening, interview, and reference process; combined with the knowledge gained during our initial assessment period, enable our client to proceed with fewer rather than more finalists.





The final candidates are presented in our candidate presentation “book.” Each finalist will have a file consisting of a candidate summary sheet, a resume, the Candidate Assessment Report (based on the formal interview), and initial candidate reference reports.

V. Selection Process

Once the final candidate interview group is identified, we will support the City with the final interview process as requested. Our firm will provide candidates with guidance related to travel planning, hotel accommodations, as well as other interview planning issues.

Our firm will also arrange for summary background evaluations (credit, civil and criminal records; education verifications; and DMV record) on the City’s final one or two candidates. A copy of these confidential reports can be provided for you. In addition, we will upon request, conduct final reference interviews for the final one or two candidates at no additional cost.

VI Recruitment Closure and Follow-Up

Based on the firm’s experience in human resource management and executive search, we are able to assist our clients in the formulation of appropriate compensation and other employment arrangements. We will be available throughout our retention to assist in this process.

As a matter of policy, Avery & Associates monitors the transition and progress of any executive we place with a client. Within the first three to six months after the City has hired the individual, we will speak with that individual to ensure that an effective transition has occurred. During the same period, we will also review the individual’s status with your office.

## Consulting Fee

Based on the services described in our proposal, the Professional Services consulting fee for this recruitment will be \$13,900. If awarded the search, we would request an initial retainer of \$4,900 at the outset of the search. A second invoice of \$4,500 would be submitted upon the Clients acceptance of a finalist candidate group. The final balance of \$4,500 would be invoiced upon acceptance of a job offer constituting completion of the search. Our invoicing models ensures the firm will remain totally committed to the City throughout the duration of the search as the final invoice is not submitted until the City has an accepted candidate. The consulting fee will be inclusive of all services defined within this proposal unless otherwise stated.



In addition to the Professional Services Fee, normal and direct out-of-pocket expenses associated with the search are charged back to the client. Expenses for this assignment would be a not-to-exceed amount of \$5,500 without the express consent of the City. These expenses include: advertising, clerical time, supplies, printing, telephone, postage and consultant travel for client discussions, meetings and local or out-of-area candidate interviews. All expense items will be detailed and billed on a monthly basis.

## Guarantees and Ethics

Whenever William Avery & Associates, Inc. is retained; we make several guarantees and commitments to a client. Due to our experience, knowledge and success within the management consulting field, we assure a client that we will only present candidates who meet a substantial majority of the ideal qualifications that you have outlined. We are also committed to continue our search efforts until a successful candidate is employed.

It is also our practice to replace a candidate who may voluntarily resign during the first year of his/her employment. This same commitment applies if the client finds it necessary to terminate or to request the resignation of the selected individual in the first year for any reason. In either case, we invoice a client only for out-of-pocket expenses incurred in identifying a replacement.



**CITY OF PASO ROBLES  
PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR – RECRUITMENT SCHEDULE**

Description (Weeks)	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20
Initial meeting(s)	<u>1</u>																			
- Job announcement draft			<u>3</u>																	
- Advertising and marketing in Place.			<u>3 - 4</u>																	
- Recruitment strategy finalized			<u>3 - 4</u>																	
- Approve and print job announcement			<u>4 - 5</u>																	
Recruitment period								<u>4 - 10</u>												
- Candidate screening								<u>6 - 10</u>												
Candidate Interviews												<u>11 - 12</u>								
- Complete references													<u>13</u>							
- Preparation of candidate book													<u>13</u>							
Presentation of candidates														<u>14</u>						
Final interviews																<u>16</u>				

Approvals/workflow 1. Dept Head 2. Admin Svcs 3. City Manager 4. City Council	<b>City of Paso Robles</b> <b>BUDGET ADJUSTMENT REQUEST</b> Search for Public Works Director	Budget JE #  AGENDA DATE <p style="text-align: right;">8/5/2014</p>
---	--	--

DESCRIPTION	ORG #	OBJECT #	PROJECT #	AMOUNT
<b>FINANCING SOURCES</b>				
General Fund	100	99999	G0002	\$19,400
<b>TOTAL FINANCING SOURCES</b>				<b>\$19,400</b>
<b>FINANCING USES</b>				
Professional Services	1001320	52240	G0002	\$19,400
<b>TOTAL FINANCING USES</b>				<b>\$19,400</b>

**JUSTIFICATION: (attach letter if required)**

<b>REQUESTED BY:</b>  _____ Date                      Department Head	<b>REVIEWED &amp; APPROVED BY:</b>  _____ Date                      Administrative Services
<b>APPROVED BY:</b>  _____ Date                      City Manager	

**PASSED AND ADOPTED** by the City Council of the City of Paso Robles, State of California, this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_ 20\_\_\_\_. Agenda Item No. \_\_\_\_\_

ATTEST: \_\_\_\_\_  
Deputy City Clerk