

TO: James L. App, City Manager
FROM: Doug Monn, Director of Public Works
SUBJECT: Road Repair (Patching) Program Temporary Staffing/Full-Time
DATE: August 20, 2013

NEEDS: For City Council to consider modifying the annual road repair (pothole) program.

- FACTS:
1. At the June 5, 2012 meeting City Council allocated \$190,000 to fund a road repair (patching) program as a priority recovery effort.
 2. \$190,000 per year was allocated to fund two (2) full-time maintenance positions (cost \$156,000) and (\$34,000) in materials to accomplish the annual/recurring road patching program.
 3. The Council suggested experimenting with temporary help instead of two full-time positions.
 4. Since November 2012, Public Works has attempted to implement the road patching program with “permanent” staff while using the temporary workers to backfill other routine maintenance tasks.
 5. It has been difficult to find and retain temporary workers capable of meeting the City’s employment standards. Since Council’s action, the City has only been able to secure two temporary workers for a total of 2080 hours.
 6. Nevertheless, permanent staff expended 3200 man hours on road patching. The unavailability of suitable temporary staff resulted in a work effort deficit of 1120 hours.
 7. This is an unsatisfactory and unsustainable outcome. It is readily resolved with the hiring of regular vs. temporary staff.
 8. Adequate funds were allocated and are available to cover the cost of regular staff and the ongoing road patching program.

Analysis &

Conclusion: Consistent with Council direction, staff attempted to strengthen its street maintenance program by allocating two existing staff members to provide full-time patching using temporary workers to backfill the maintenance void created by the re-allocation. The city has been unable to retain and/or maintain temporary staff on a regular basis.

Discussion at the June 5, 2012 included reconsidering the hire of full-time staffing should a temporary staffing solution fail to provide the workforce necessary increase street maintenance without reducing the city’s maintenance capability.

POLICY

REFERENCE: 2012 Recovery Plan

Fiscal

Impact: Retention of two full-time staff Maintenance I or II positions would cost \$156,000 and is fully funded by the existing Recovery Priority Allocation of \$190,000.

- OPTIONS:
- a. Adopt Resolution No. 13-xxx increasing the General Fund full-time workforce from nine to eleven providing for continued street maintenance using existing Recovery Funding.
 - b. Amend, modify or reject the above option.

- Attachments:
- 1) June 5, 2012 Recovery Priority Staff Report
 - 2) September 4, 2012 Temporary Staff/Full-Time Staffing Staff Report
 - 3) Resolution

TO: James L. App, City Manager
FROM: Doug Monn, Public Works Director
SUBJECT: Recovery Priority – Pothole Repair Options
DATE: June 5, 2012

NEEDS: For City Council to consider selection of a pothole repair option.

- FACTS:
1. The City has over of 148 miles of paved surface plus nearly 260 miles of curb, gutter and sidewalk to maintain.
 2. The cost to restore streets to 80% of new is estimated at 80 million dollars.
 3. Once restored the annual cost to maintain streets at an average of 80% of new is estimated at \$3.5 million dollars annually.
 4. Until a method of financing the needed repairs can be found, the City could intensify its pothole patching program.
 5. The City Council includes \$190,000/yr. for pothole patching in the recovery priorities. Option to effect pothole repair include:

Option #1- Addition equipment and one staff person. The Recovery Plan presentation discussed a Lease/Purchase Pothole Patching Vehicle and one (1) full time staff equivalent, to repair up to 200 potholes and/or alligator asphalt per 8 hour shift, 4,000 per month or 48,000 potholes per year.*

• Equipment Cost (lease option per year)	\$ 66,000
• Maintenance Specialist II position	\$ 78,000
• Material	<u>\$ 46,000</u>
Cost per year for patch truck program	\$190,000

**Based on manufacture's estimates*

Option #2 – Addition of two (2) full time staff equivalents to the single remaining individual assigned to streets (establishing a three man crew). A dedicated three man crew could repair 32 potholes per 8 hour shift, 640 potholes per month, 7,680 potholes per year and might:

- Start a crack sealing program on residential streets.
- Curb painting and street marking as time allows.

• Two Maintenance Specialist II positions	\$156,000
• Material	<u>\$ 34,000</u>
Cost per year for two full time staff	\$190,000

Option #3 - Outsource the patching program. Caltrans and prevailing wage cost for labor and equipment is approximately \$153.50 per hour** would purchase approximately 78 hours

per month allowing repair of 288 (32 per 8 hour shift) potholes monthly or 938 hours per year resulting in 3,456 potholes per year.

- Labor/Truck \$144,000
 - Material \$ 46,000
- Cost per year for outside contract \$190,000

***Dump Truck \$54.74, 2 ea. Group 2 Labor at \$31.47(\$62.94 total) each and a driver at \$35.82*

ANALYSIS &

CONCLUSION: Option #1 (pothole patching machine) has the greatest numerical potential for repair of potholes. Option #2 may be the most flexible, possibly increasing the City's ability to address repair of potholes while also providing some flexibility to address other maintenance needs. Options #3 would result in the least number of repairs verses cost.

POLICY

REFERENCE: Recovery Options 2012

FISCAL

IMPACT: \$190,000 annually

- OPTIONS:
- a. Council determines preferred option and authorizes preparation of a resolution to authorize appropriation and implementation.
 - b. Amend, modify, or reject the above option.

TO: James L. App, City Manager
FROM: Doug Monn, Public Works Director
SUBJECT: **Temporary Staffing/Full-Time Staffing for Street Maintenance**
DATE: September 4, 2012

NEEDS: For City Council to consider road maintenance staffing options associated with City Recovery Initiatives.

FACTS:

1. The Recovery Initiative included \$190,000 per year for street maintenance.
2. The street maintenance option included two (2) full-time maintenance positions to provide the requisite labor.
3. At close of the public discussion Council requested staff compare the cost/benefit of seasonal part-time versus two full-time positions.

ANALYSIS &

CONCLUSION: The recession resulted in a decrease of Public Works Maintenance staff from 27 full-time positions to 9. As a result maintenance has suffered throughout the City. The most visible street repair needs are potholes and general pavement degradation, however, street maintenance entails more including:

- Leaf removal & drainage
- Emergency tree work
- Curb/sidewalk repair
- Street markings
- Signage repairs
- Flooded streets
- Curb painting
- Street lights

The staffing of a continuous street maintenance effort could be done with full-time employees or temporary help. The comparative direct costs, including all benefits, are:

- Full-time: \$29-\$35 per hour
- Temporary: \$23-\$25 per hour

Regular full-time City staff provide workforce stability, comparatively less daily demand on supervisors, and assignment flexibility, but are the more expensive option, and have vested employment rights.

Temporary workers are less expensive and provide workforce flexibility (as they can be contracted or released at any time), but can demand comparatively more training (and retraining as they rotate through) and supervision, and add less stability/predictability to the workforce.

Temporary workers would be limited to no more than six months employment before rotation.

POLICY

REFERENCE: 2012 Recovery Plan

FISCAL

IMPACT: \$190,000 per year for five years as established under the City Recovery Initiative

OPTIONS:

- a. Adopt Resolution No. 12-xx:
 1. Retain two full-time individuals.
 2. Retain temporary individuals, as a means to identify/recruit capable regular full-time staff and/or until the 2013 budget projection update (February 2013) to allow additional time to accrue General Fund Revenue data before hiring two full-time employees.
 3. Use temporary help to staff the street maintenance effort.
- b. Amend, modify, or reject the above options.

Attachment: June 5, 2012 Recovery Priority Staff Report

RESOLUTION NO. 13-xxx

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PASO ROBLES
TO RETAIN TWO BUDGETED BUT UNFUNDED FULL-TIME PUBLIC WORK
MAINTENANCE POSITIONS

WHEREAS, On June 5th, 2012 the City Council considered staffing options associated with City Recovery Initiatives.

WHEREAS, the City Council moved to allocate \$190,000 to enhance the maintenance of City Streets, including the hire two full-time equivalents with the stipulation that staff also examine the potential of staffing the positions seasonally using temporary staff positions; and

WHEREAS, Staff did attempt to enhance maintenance using temporary staffing; and

WHEREAS, The inability to retain and maintain two temporary staff position did reduce maintenance capabilities; and

WHEREAS, The June 5th, 2012 staff report established that should temporary staffing not provide the means to implement City recovery Initiatives, Council would consider retention of two full-time employees.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED AS FOLLOWS:

SECTION 1. The City Council of the City of El Paso de Robles does hereby move to retain two full-time individuals to assist with maintenance as established in the 2012 Recovery Plan using monies previously allocated in the City Recovery Plan.

PASSED AND ADOPTED by the City Council of the City of Paso Robles this 20th day of August 2013 by the following votes:

AYES:
NOES:
ABSTAIN:
ABSENT:

Duane Picanco, Mayor

ATTEST:

Caryn Jackson, Deputy City Clerk